

REASONING:

1. Evidence that a person possesses an unspecified quantity of marijuana in their home does not, standing alone, establish probable cause to believe the person is breaking the law. Thus, the search and seizure provisions of our State Constitution prohibit the issuance of a search warrant without some additional indication of illegality, such as evidence suggesting that the marijuana is being sold or the amount of marijuana equals or exceeds the statutory ceiling of four ounces.

2. We cannot simply assume that there is a direct proportionality between the strength of the odor (smelled by the officers) and the amount of marijuana giving rise to that odor.

3. Although the officer asserted in his affidavit that the electricity usage at the home was higher than average for a house of its size, the officer did not say how much higher than average this usage was.

4. In several prior decisions, this Court had accepted the premise that the smell of growing marijuana could establish probable cause for a search. In those prior instances, the smell of growing marijuana emanating from a house was persuasive evidence that someone was breaking the law; this is no longer the case. (emphasis added)

NOTES:

Ravin v. State (537 P.2d 494) allowing possession for personal use of marijuana under Alaska's Constitution was decided in 1975. The Noy v. State (83 P.3d 545), which reaffirmed Ravin, was decided in 2003.

Some of the cases that had allowed for probable cause based on smelling marijuana and excess electrical usage included:

McGahan & Seaman v. State, Legal Bulletin No. 155

McClelland v. State, Legal Bulletin No. 212

Wallace v. State, Legal Bulletin No. 215

Michael v. State, Legal Bulletin No. 228

The State Attorney's Office has indicated they will file an appeal on this case to ask the Alaska Supreme Court to reverse the Court of Appeals' decision.

NOTE TO SUBSCRIBERS TO THE ALASKA LEGAL BRIEFS MANUAL:

Add this case to Section M, "Warrants, Affidavits and Informants," of your Contents and Text. File Legal Bulletin No. 286 numerically under Section R of the manual.